Exam in Model Checking<br>March 30, 2009

## Solution

## Solution 1

Let $P$ be a linear time property. Prove that $P$ is a liveness property if and only if $\operatorname{closure}(P)=\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$.

## Solution:

$P$ is a liveness property iff closure $(P)=\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$.
$\Longrightarrow$ Let $P$ be a liveness property. Then $\operatorname{pref}(P)=\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star}$. Hence

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{closure}(P) & =\left\{\sigma^{\prime} \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega} \mid \operatorname{pref}(\sigma) \subseteq \operatorname{pref}(P)\right\} \\
& =\left\{\sigma^{\prime} \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega} \mid \operatorname{pref}(\sigma) \subseteq\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star}\right\} \\
& =\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Longleftarrow$ Let closure $(P)=\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$. We show that $\operatorname{pref}(P)=\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star}$ : Therefore assume that there exists $\hat{\sigma} \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star} \backslash \operatorname{pref}(P)$. Then $\operatorname{pref}\left(\hat{\sigma} \sigma^{\prime \prime}\right) \nsubseteq \operatorname{pref}(P)$ for all $\sigma^{\prime \prime} \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$ and hence $\hat{\sigma} \sigma^{\prime \prime} \notin$ closure $(P)$. In this way, we obtain a contradiction to our assumption. Therefore, $\operatorname{pref}(P) \supseteq\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star}$ and our claim follows.

## Solution 2

Let $P$ denote the linear time property over the set $A P=\{a, b\}$ of atomic propositions such that $P$ consists of all infinite traces $\sigma=A_{0} A_{1} A_{2} \cdots \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$ that satisfy

$$
\forall i \geq 0 .\left(A_{i}=\emptyset \Longrightarrow \exists k \geq i .\left(b \in A_{k} \wedge \forall j \in\{i, \ldots, k-1\} . a \notin A_{j}\right)\right)
$$

(a) Specify an LTL formula $\varphi$ such that $\operatorname{Words}(\varphi)=P$.
(b) Give an $\omega$-regular expression for $P$.
(c) Apply the decomposition theorem and give $\omega$-regular expressions for $P_{\text {safe }}$ and $P_{\text {live }}$.

Solution:
(a) $\square((\neg a \wedge \neg b) \rightarrow(\neg a) \cup b)$
(b) Let $E=\left(\{a\}+\{b\}+\{a, b\}+\emptyset^{+} .(\{b\}+\{a, b\})\right)$.

Then $P=\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(E^{\omega}\right)$.
(c) We obtain the safety and liveness properties as follows:

$$
\begin{aligned}
P_{\text {safe }} & =\text { closure }(P) \\
& =\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(E^{\omega}+E^{\star} . \emptyset^{\omega}\right) \\
& =\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(\left(\{a\}+\{b\}+\{a, b\}+\emptyset^{+} .(\{b\}+\{a, b\})\right)^{\omega}+\left(\{a\}+\{b\}+\{a, b\}+\emptyset^{+} \cdot(\{b\}+\{a, b\})\right)^{\star} . \emptyset^{\omega}\right) \\
\bar{P}_{\text {safe }} & =\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star} . \emptyset \cdot\{a\} \cdot\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega} \\
P_{\text {live }} & =P \cup\left(\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega} \backslash P_{\text {safe }}\right) \\
& =P \cup \bar{P}_{\text {safe }} \\
& =\left(\{a\}+\{b\}+\{a, b\}+\emptyset^{+} .(\{b\}+\{a, b\})\right)^{\omega}+\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\star} . \emptyset \cdot\{a\} \cdot\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Solution 3

Let $\varphi=(a \wedge \bigcirc a) \mathrm{U}(\neg(\neg a \mathrm{U} a))$ be a LTL formula over $A P=\{a\}$.
(a) Compute all elementary sets with respect to closure $(\varphi)$ !

Hint: There are 7 elementary sets.
(b) Use the algorithm from the lecture to construct the GNBA $\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}$ with $\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}\right)=\operatorname{Words}(\varphi)$ :

- Define the set of initial states and the acceptance component.
- Depict the transition relation of $\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}$.

Hint: It suffices to consider the reachable elementary sets only!
(c) Informally describe the language $\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}\right)$.

## Solution:

(a) The elementary sets are:

|  | $a$ | $\bigcirc a$ | $\neg a \cup a$ | $a \wedge \bigcirc a$ | $\varphi$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $B_{1}$ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| $B_{2}$ | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| $B_{3}$ | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| $B_{4}$ | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| $B_{5}$ | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| $B_{6}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| $B_{7}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

(b) The GNBA $\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}=\left(Q, \Sigma, \delta, Q_{0}, \mathcal{F}\right)$ is defined by:

$$
\begin{aligned}
Q & =\left\{B_{1}, B_{2}, B_{3}, B_{4}, B_{5}, B_{6}, B_{7}\right\} \\
\Sigma & =2^{\{a\}}=\{\emptyset,\{a\}\} \\
Q_{0} & =\left\{B_{1}, B_{3}, B_{7}\right\} \\
\mathcal{F} & =\left\{F_{\neg a \cup a}, F_{\varphi}\right\} \\
F_{\neg a \cup a} & =\left\{B_{1}, B_{3}, B_{5}, B_{6}, B_{7}\right\} \\
F_{\varphi} & =\left\{B_{1}, B_{2}, B_{3}, B_{4}, B_{5}, B_{6}\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

The transition relation $\delta$ is given by the following graph representation (where also the unreachable
 parts are outlined - not necessary in the exam):
(c) The accepted language $\mathcal{L}_{\omega}\left(\mathcal{G}_{\varphi}\right)$ is the singleton $\left\{\emptyset^{\omega}\right\}$.

Let $P$ denote the set of traces $\sigma=A_{0} A_{1} A_{2} \cdots \in\left(2^{A P}\right)^{\omega}$ over $A P=\{a, b\}$ such that there exist infinitely many indices $k \geq 0$ with $A_{k}=\emptyset$. Consider the following transition system $T S$ :


For each of the fairness assumptions
(a) $\mathcal{F}_{1}=(\{\{\alpha\}\},\{\{\beta\},\{\delta, \gamma\}\}, \emptyset)$ and
(b) $\left.\mathcal{F}_{2}=(\{\{\alpha\}\},\{\{\beta\},\{\delta\},\{\gamma\}\}, \emptyset\}\right)$ :

Decide whether $T S \models_{\mathcal{F}_{i}} P$ for $i=1,2$. Justify your answers!

## Solution:

We consider each of the fairness assumptions $\mathcal{F}_{i}$ for $i \in\{1,2\}$ : We have $T S{\models \mathcal{F}_{i}}$ Piff FairTraces $\mathcal{F}_{i}(T S) \subseteq$ $P$. Because of $\stackrel{\infty}{\exists} k . A_{k}=\emptyset$, each trace has to visit $s_{3}$ infinitely many times.
(a) $T S \not \vDash_{\mathcal{F}_{1}} P$ : Consider the execution $\pi=\left(s_{0} s_{2} s_{1} s_{1}\right)^{\omega}$. It is $\mathcal{F}_{1}$-fair but $\pi \not \vDash \square \diamond(\neg a \wedge \neg b)$.
(b) $T S \models_{\mathcal{F}_{2}} P$ :

- Any trace that reaches $s_{4}$ is not $\mathcal{F}_{2}$-fair as $\alpha$ is executed only finitely many times. This is in contradiction to our $\mathcal{F}_{2, \text { ucond }}=\{\{\alpha\}\}$.
- Therefore $s_{3} \xrightarrow{\delta} s_{4}$ is never taken.
- Because of $\{\gamma\} \in \mathcal{F}_{2, \text { strong }}$, the $\alpha$-loop of $s_{1}$ cannot be taken infinitely long.
- Because of $\{\beta\} \in \mathcal{F}_{2, \text { strong }}$, we take the transition $s_{0} \xrightarrow{s}{ }_{2}$ infinitely often.
- Because of $\{\delta\} \in \mathcal{F}_{2, \text { strong }}$, we take the transition $s_{2} \stackrel{s}{\rightarrow}_{3}$ infinitely often.

Therefore FairTraces $\mathcal{F}_{1}(T S) \subseteq P$ and $T S \models_{\mathcal{F}_{1}} P$.

## Solution 5a

Consider the following transition systems $T S_{1}$ and $T S_{2}$ :

(a) Compute $T S_{1} / \sim$ and $T S_{2} / \sim$.
(b) Decide whether $T S_{1} \sim T S_{2}$. Explain your answer.

## Solution:

(a) The quotient transition systems for $T S_{1}$ and $T S_{2}$ are:


$$
\begin{array}{rlrl}
\mathcal{R} & =\mathrm{Id} & \\
{\left[s_{1}\right]} & =\left\{s_{1}\right\} & & {\left[s_{2}\right]=\left\{s_{2}\right\}} \\
{\left[s_{3}\right]} & =\left\{s_{3}\right\} & & {\left[s_{4}\right]=\left\{s_{4}\right\}} \\
{\left[s_{5}\right]} & =\left\{s_{5}\right\} &
\end{array}
$$



$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{R} & =\left\{\left(t_{1}, t_{5}\right),\left(t_{2}, t_{3}\right),\left(t_{2}, t_{6}\right)\right\}^{*} \\
{\left[t_{1}\right] } & =\left\{t_{1}, t_{5}\right\} \\
{\left[t_{2}\right] } & =\left\{t_{2}, t_{3}, t_{6}\right\} \\
{\left[t_{4}\right] } & =\left\{t_{4}\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

(b) $T S_{1} \nsim T S_{2}$ : Note that $s_{1} \nsim t_{1}$ as $s_{1}$ has successors in three equivalence classes whereas $t_{1}$ only has successors to $\left[t_{2}\right]$ and to $\left[t_{4}\right]$.

## Solution 5b

Let $\varphi$ be an LTL-formula, $T S=(S, A c t, \rightarrow, I, A P, L)$ be a transition system and $s \in S$.
(a) Prove or disprove: $s \models \varphi \Longleftrightarrow s \not \vDash \neg \varphi$.
(b) Prove that $\diamond(a \wedge \square b) \mathrm{W} \neg b \equiv \diamond(\neg b \vee \square(a \wedge b))$.

## Solution:

(a) Let $\varphi=\bigcirc a$ and consider the transition system


Then $s_{0} \not \models \neg \bigcirc a$ (because of $\pi=s_{0} s_{1}$ ) and $s_{0} \not \models \bigcirc a$ (because of $\pi=s_{0} s_{2}$ ).
Therefore $s_{0} \models \varphi \Longleftrightarrow s_{0} \not \models \neg \varphi$.
(b) We proceed as follows:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\diamond(a \wedge \square b) \mathrm{W}(\neg b) & \equiv \diamond[(a \wedge \square b) \mathrm{U}(\neg b) \vee \square(a \wedge \square b)] \\
& \equiv \diamond(a \wedge \square b) \mathrm{U}(\neg b) \vee \diamond \square(a \wedge \square b) \\
& \equiv \diamond \neg b \vee \diamond(\square a \wedge \square \square b) \\
& \equiv \diamond \neg b \vee \diamond(\square a \wedge \square b) \\
& \equiv \diamond \neg b \vee \diamond \square(a \wedge b) \\
& \equiv \diamond(\neg b \vee \square(a \wedge b))
\end{aligned}
$$

